

34
The case for local government rests upon the proposition that it is the system that provides the most effective training school in the manner in which governmental power may be exercised; it familiarises both electors and elected with the methods of public administration; it brings a desirable publicity to the activities of popular representatives and thus tends to raise the moral tone of official conduct; and finally, it promotes a vigorous local opinion about matters of government which may effectively be opposed to the tendencies ~~of~~ towards excessive centralisation of government functions.

Sir Henry Parkes, "The Empire " 5/11/1856.

Centralisation paralyses the political functions of the masses. This is bad for the habits of the people themselves. It is equally bad for their affairs, which can never be so well conducted as under their own eye, and by their own officers, commanded and paid on the spot. It is bad for the central government and the legislature, creating undue patronage, imposing undue burdens, and causing a waste of expenditure scarcely possible to check. And finally, it is bad for the representative principle, for it tends to the absorption of all individualities ~~into~~ in the mass, and to make that mass inert and impotent against too much accumulated power in the legislature.

Robson. p.63.

All kinds of arguments, both true and false, and all manner of accusations, are employed by the spokesmen of suburban or outlying areas to oppose absorption by the great municipality. They usually represent an attempted rationalisation of underlying currents of feeling which are often subconscious.

By far the best way of meeting these objections is by means of a two-tier system of local government. There are substantial advantages in establishing a major authority for the planning, co-ordination and administration of large-scale functions, while leaving all the purely local services to a lower tier of minor authorities. The arguments for a two tier system in a great metropolitan area are overwhelming, for only by such a method is it possible for the suburban and outlying districts to retain their ~~identity~~ institutional identity and communal life whilst becoming part of the metropolitan area for the larger governmental purposes.

Only by this means, moreover, can we hope to find a solution to the problem of providing ... a democratic system of local government while also giving the citizen a smaller and more easily comprehensible unit of community life in whose government he can participate.

Robson p 67.

Professor Thomas H. Reed ... considers that where several important functions have been entrusted to a single ad-hoc authority, the result is a close approach to what he calls "the federated city". He cites as an example the Massachusetts Metropolitan District Commission, which has been made responsible for sewers, water supply, parks and planning in Greater Boston.

Robson writes of " an indirectly elected, ad-hoc authority gradually acquiring the power to perform a wide range of functions, and thereby becoming in effect the principal organ of metropolitan government..... He then asks:-- is there any reason to believe that such a movement would not meet with fierce opposition on the part of all the minor local authorities , and in addition the chief municipality, whose interests would be jeopardised by such a development ?

Bland, F.A., A REVIEW OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT IN NEW SOUTH WALES. L.G.Summer School, 1945.

p.34. "Recently, the Blue Mountains County Council has been established and has been given power to operate a number of functions. If this precedent is followed, the County Council may develop from the ad-hoc to the compendious authority. "

SPECIALISATION AND THE "AD-HOCS"

We have seen that the mainspring of the Greater Sydney movement was the financial weakness of the numerous small municipalities; ^{they were} ~~which left them~~ unable to carry out all the functions expected of them. Since nothing was done to co-ordinate major essential services through a Greater Sydney Council, various State Government, found an acceptable solution in the "ad-hoc" (literally "for this") special purpose authority.

"The attractiveness of the ad-hoc idea is not difficult to understand in a situation such as that which exists in London. The ground is littered with multifarious elected authorities possessing jurisdiction over utterly inadequate areas. Each one of these authorities is a centre of potential opposition to any rational scheme of reform. On the other hand, the technical needs of a service - water, transport or whatever it may be - are easily ascertained and strongly urged by responsible administrators or independent experts who at least desire to promote the efficiency of that service. Hence the wary politician, the timid civil servant and the technical specialist readily turn to the ad-hoc authority as the easiest way out of their difficulties.....Sometimes the more pressing technical difficulties may be assuaged for a time. But ultimately the ad-hoc body gives rise to as many problems as it solves."X

The city-region of Sydney has demanded efficient management of its main roads, water supply, sewerage, electricity supply, transport, fire brigades, harbour facilities, gas supply, telephone service, public health, education, police, public health, etc. All these and more are commonly accepted as local government responsibilities in England, where the principle applies that "whatever touches the private citizen closest, at his own front door, should be under his direct local control". It is commonly considered,

X "The Government and Misgovernment of London" by W.A. Robson.

for example, that the police force should be locally managed to prevent those abuses associated with centralised power. That education also is more easily safeguarded from totalitarian influence under decentralised control seems well established in England. Unfortunately, the small size and inadequate resources of local areas in New South Wales, (resulting from, and interacting to reinforce centralising trends) have meant that they are incapable of managing these affairs. So it has come about that many proper local government functions are, in New South Wales today, carried out by the State Government; those major functions that remain are managed by special authorities that are constituted in all sorts of different and confusing ways. The illogical ~~and~~ organisation of these special ad-hoc bodies is in itself a threat to that comprehension of governmental processes which is so essential to democracy. For example the Metropolitan Water Sewerage and Drainage Board is part-elected while the Maritime Services Board is wholly appointed; and citizens must have difficulty in comprehending the difference between the Sydney County Council, the Electricity Commission, the Cumberland County Council, the MacKellar County Council and the St. George County Council. Confusion piles upon confusion, while the average citizen gives up the attempt to understand his rights, privileges and duties. Nevertheless, it remains true that Sydney would be in a sorry state today if these authorities had not existed or done their jobs so efficiently. We will deal with a few of these in brief outline.

Roads.

Road Trusts were set up to finance and build local roads from 1848 onwards; it is not surprising that they could not raise sufficient capital locally to provide roads for the fast expanding areas of settlement, and they passed

out of existence in the eighteen nineties without achieving any outstanding success. The task was given to Municipalities and Shires under the 1906 Local Government Act, but proved too expensive a business for local bodies. The main roads got progressively worse; seven attempts were made to set up a Main Roads Board before the Main Roads Act of 1925 was passed. The Board was abolished in 1932, when the State Government Department of Main Roads was established to take over the job. The Department has continued ever since under ~~the control of~~ a Commissioner for Main Roads.

Since 1919, subdividers have had to construct local roads to the satisfaction of the Local Council, after which the latter accepts responsibility for maintenance.

"The Department co-operates with the municipal and shire councils in the work of constructing and maintaining a well organised system of main highways, with the primary object of developing the lands in the State, feeding the railways with traffic, giving the primary producers access to markets, and providing facilities for motor traffic." X

Public Transport

The control of this essential service also has a history linked with municipal inadequacy. In 1847, the City Corporation was given power to regulate hackney coaches within an 8-mile city radius. Various powers passed to the other Municipalities in 1858 and 1867; but dissatisfaction with this divided control grew until a Select Committee of 1870 recommended central administration of public transport.

A Board of Transport Commissioners was consequently set up in 1873 despite bitter opposition from both City and Suburban authorities. The Board was abolished in 1900 and control passed to the Police.

A Metropolitan Transport Trust was the next attempt (1930) to regulate tramways, registration, and public vehicles. In its search for efficiency this Board taxed competing privately-run public transport almost out of existence.

Following a similar pattern to the Old Main Roads Board, the Transport Trust in 1932 was abolished, its powers being handed over to the Department of Road Transport and Tramways under the administration of a Commissioner.

Sydney Harbour and Maritime Services

Bubonic plague ravaged Sydney in 1899-1900. It was traced to the
X New South Wales Official Yearbook, 1947-48, p. 592.

privately owned wharves of Darling Harbour, which was polluted by sewerage, and the foreshores of which abounded in rats. The Government resumed the waterfront from Dawes Point to the head of Darling Harbour. An Act of 1901 gave control of the Port of Sydney to the Sydney Harbour Trust, which continued until 1936, then being re-constituted under the name of the Maritime Services Board. The powers of the Board regarding shipping and navigation now extend to all ports on the N.S.W. coast; the Board consists entirely of Government appointees. Other authorities which control some aspects of waterfront areas in the County are the Department of Lands, the Department of Public Works, the Chief Secretary's Department (Fisheries), the Commonwealth Government (defence, quarantine) and it is possible for land below high water mark to be given over to a Local Government authority by proclamation.

Water and Sewerage

The Sewerage and Health Board was set up in 1875 when the death rate was rising because of the inadequate sewerage system. The City Corporation had been struggling to build proper sewer outfalls to the sea for many years, but nothing had been done to replace the original South-North system discharging into the Harbour constructed by the City Commissioners of 1854-57.

It was not until 1899 that the Bondi outfall and the Botany Bay schemes were complete.

While the City authorities complacently regarded the Botany Swamps as a never-ending source of water supply for Sydney, the position became increasingly grave. As early as 1867 a Royal Commission had recommended an Upper Nepean Scheme. A drought in 1876 drove the point home with some severity, and the Metropolitan Water and Sewerage Act was passed in 1880. The Nepean Scheme was at last begun; completed in 1888, it was handed over to a new Metropolitan Water and Sewerage Board.

Another Act in 1924 granted the Board financial autonomy and the power to construct its own works, which had previously been done by the Public Works Department. The present Board operates under a revised Act of 1935; it is part appointed by the State Government, and part elected by Local Government bodies. The Board controls an area approximating to the County of Cumberland.

Electricity and Gas

Electricity supplies are handled at State, ad-hoc, and local government levels. Prior to 1950, there were four major generating authorities:- the Southern Electricity Supply, the Sydney County Council, the Department of Railways and the Balmain Company. A degree of interconnection of their various systems was commenced and continued during the war as a defense measure. Expansion was halted during this time, and the post-war years saw a serious supply deficiency. A period of crisis followed, blackouts were widespread, and the Government introduced several co-ordinating measures. A State Electricity Commission was set up in 1950 with powers of acquisition over the four major suppliers. The Commission is now the constructing and generating authority for an area considerably larger than the County. The Commission sells in bulk to the reticulating authorities in the County which are the St. George, the Sydney and the Mackerellar County Councils.

The Sydney County Council was set up in 1935 to take over the electricity undertaking of the Sydney Municipal Council, which dated back to the 8th July, 1904 - the day on which Sydney streets were first lit by electricity.

Sydney's gas supplies have remained in the hands of private enterprise although power to join together for the construction of gas-works was given to Local Councils early this century. The suppliers of today are the Australian Gas Light Company and the North Shore Gas Company.

Open Spaces

Unfortunately no ad-hoc body was ever set up to manage major parklands, headlands and foreshores in and about the County of Cumberland. Local Councils have had plenty of powers to reserve lands since 1858, but the serious lack of open spaces in many of our suburbs is a silent commentary on their work in this regard.

The Lands Department, controlling all Crown Land, has to some extent offset this deficiency by setting aside such areas as "National" Park (35,000 acres) and the Ku-Ring-Gai Chase (38,000 acres) within the County to the South and North of the city. These areas are controlled by separate appointed bodies of Trustees. The Lands Department, however, can do nothing to old Crown Land already alienated (i.e. sold to private persons).

The task now falls to the Cumberland County Council. This planning body is ~~now~~ making steady progress in reclaiming much alienated land; it is possible that the Council will take more active steps in the future to provide open spaces of County significance X

Markets

Local Councils have had the power to set up markets since 1919; no outstanding achievement in this field can be claimed. Instead, the City Council's Markets have developed as a centralised County function. Chaos and confusion now reigns in the central city Marketing area. The Cumberland County Council has had approved its scheme for their removal to Homebush; the State Government, in commissioning the C.C.C. to plan re-location, stipulated that only one Market was required for the whole County, and has yet given no indication of who will manage the future establishment.

X "of County significance" is defined as an area greater than 15 acres.

Housing

In 1912, the Sydney Corporation Dwelling Houses Act was passed, but only four housing schemes were undertaken in consequence. Although the 1919 Act gave construction powers to Local Councils, practically nothing has been done.

A State Housing Act was passed in 1912 and a Housing Board was appointed; neither did this authority achieve anything of consequence. However, in 1941, a Ministry of Housing was created, and a new Housing Act passed. In 1942 the State Housing Commission was constituted under a Commonwealth-State agreement.

The Housing Commission so far has concentrated on building single cottages at minimum cost in outlying suburban areas, although a Surrey Hills redevelopment scheme, and the "biggest block of flats in the Southern Hemisphere" have been undertaken. However, there will be many many more acres of sub-standard housing ripe for re-development in the next ten years; whether the State Housing Commission will handle these tasks remains to be seen.

Public Health

This is a vital matter for cities; we can here only note a few aspects in passing.

Public Health is a wide field, and various Government Departments, Boards, and Commissions control parts of it. The powers of the Local Councils are set out in the Act of 1919; they include the collection and removal of garbage. Garbage collection and disposal has become a major problem for the Councils of heavily built up areas. They cannot dispose of it within their own boundaries, and adjacent areas may not be willing to receive it. Such problems do not arise in Brisbane, where the centralist Brisbane City Council maintains a highly efficient system of metropolitan garbage disposal.

The County Councils

The County Councils are the ad-hocs most closely associated with Local

Government; they are formed by a federal union of several Areas to carry out specific duty.

It was not until the Local Government Act of 1919 that general clauses permitted the establishment of County Councils. Here at last was the machinery for cooperation; the first to be based on this legislation was the St. George County Council; others outside the County dealt with Noxious Weeds such as the Water Hyacinth in the Hunter River...

There are now 38 County Councils in the State; they do not yet embrace the whole area of New South Wales. The policy of the Local Government Association is that Regional Councils should be set up according to the plan prepared by the Premier's Department. Such regional authorities should in the Association's view, be well financed compendious authorities capable of constructing major regional public works.

This policy stresses the crying need for co-ordination.

Sydney cannot solve its great problems without it. Coordination can be easily achieved by a dictator. Are we to confess our failure to get it democratically?

"The most serious drawback of the ad-hoc body is that there is no method of co-ordinating its work with related activities carried out by other bodies. It has one, and only one, object in view; and it is in a sense failing to discharge its duty if it attempts to take a comprehensive view of things. Yet the services of a great modern city are becoming more interrelated every day, and even their efficiency is determined to no small extent by the degree of co-ordination that is attained. Housing, planning, transport, highways --- how can one separate such a group as these?" *

* Robson W.A. "The government and misgovernment of London"

1. It is assumed that the joint study carried out by officers of this Council and the D.M.R. will result in a delineation on a map of:-

- a) Those roads the construction of which is intended to be undertaken before 1980,
- b) Those roads the construction of which is not intended to be undertaken until after that date.

The reference to construction may be implied as meaning acquisition of property affected.

2. The D.M.R. may be in a position further to refinesness to indicate a programme of say 5 years and succeeding 10-year periods up to 1980. The basis of the County Road Programme whether in general two-period terms or particularised further is a consideration of motor traffic needs related to the extent and condition of development on the County road routes and the direction and character of development for which the County Scheme provides.

3. This represents a partial answer to the problem, the remaining question being how effect can be given to the decisions reached as to phasing the acquisition and/or construction programme.

4. The latter part of the problem concerned this Council, the D.M.R. and the State Government. The purpose of this memorandum is accordingly to discuss the problem and to set down certain data for examination initially by officers of the Council and Departments concerned with a view to establishing and applying a solution.

5. The factors against which any solution must be measured up are as follows:-

- a) The reservation of vacant land for County Roads presents no difficulty in that the Council is prepared to acquire such land forthwith.
- b) Where a County Road reservation casts a shadow on a property the owner suffers as soon as he seeks either to sell or mortgage the property.
- c) The loss in such dealings arises from:
 - i) the refusal generally of the major lending agencies to accept County Road affected property as security for mortgage,
 - ii) Reluctance of a potential purchaser to accept the uncertainty of tenure.

- d) Except in the circumstances under b) and c) above, the injurious affection is no more than an uncertainty as to the period of uninterrupted enjoyment of the property. Arising from this:
- i) the right to extend and improve the property is restricted, and
 - ii) there may be created a reluctance to undertake full work of maintenance of the property and in consequence a deterioration in its condition.
- e) Where a County Road is a widening of an existing road, reliance on the realignment procedure does not alter the fact of injurious affection in the sense indicated under b) & c) above but it may be said that under d) the County Scheme affect it no more or less than the effect of realignment.
- f) The total cost of acquisition of property to construct the County Roads under 1.a) above is of the order of £20 m. of which approximately £6 m. is for properties required for widening existing roads.
- g) The cost of construction works for roads in the first period is of the order of £36 m. including approximately £20 m. for bridges; this estimate does not include cost of city distributor roads.

FIRST PERIOD ROADS

7. It appears that an immediate result of publication of a road programme in the sense of a first 25-year period and thereafter will be to aggravate the situation in respect of properties affected by the first period. That is to say the prescription of a 25-year programme is likely, because there is no indication to the contrary, to be interpreted as an immediate programme in respect of any particular property. For this reason it is thought necessary to study the two periods separately.

There are two general possibilities to examine:-

- a) a solution which involves maintaining a restriction on development but without acquisition, and
- b) one which involves accepting an obligation to acquire properties affected.

8. With regard to the first approach, there are legal questions in doubt but a possible indication of the Bingham case is the likelihood that it will be found that the County Road affect is an injurious affection measurable as the difference in market value with or without the County road shadow and that the Council will not be able to sustain the realignment argument. 8000 claims were made in respect of built-up property affected by County Roads totalling

£70 m. As this averages over £8000 per claim it is assumed that in general the claims represent something in excess of the full value of properties affected. As a very general indication of magnitude, it appears possible that the decrease in value may be between 10% & 20%, so that if compensation were paid it might, in respect of roads in the first period, be 4 or 5 millions.

9. Without further study it is not possible to see whether, if such monies were paid as compensation for injurious affection, regard would be paid to these amounts on subsequent acquisition of the properties. On the surface there appears at least a possibility that the only advantage to the authorities in paying compensation as so outlined would be to prevent an extension of constructional development and so increase the eventual cost of acquisition and works. The obvious disadvantage being the payment of an enormous sum of money with ^{Commensurate} no compensative gain. This approach has not been examined further and attention has been directed towards a solution involving acquisition.

10. The difficulties and disadvantages of acquisition are as follows:-

- a) it would necessitate a large sum of money being made available for capital payment,
- b) expenditure on widespread acquisition would result in a correspondingly smaller amount being available for construction, the consequence being a delay in construction as compared with a situation whereby acquisition is directed to those sections of road must immediately be constructed,
- c) acquisition of property many years in advance of its being required for works is fundamentally unsound unless there is a return on the money during the interim or unless the property appreciates materially in value,
- d) the authority becoming possessed of the property must undertake a property managing commitment.

11. To some extent some of these ^{dis}advantages could be overcome or mitigated. It is assumed that the majority of properties will be subject to a mortgage and that in purchasing the property the mortgage can be transferred to the acquiring authority. Whilst this would involve a long-term repayment of principal and interest the initial outlay would be lessened. From this aspect a broad indication of the magnitude of the financial commitment might be as follows:

12. Assuming total value of properties to be 20 millions of which 5 million are on mortgage, the initial capital payment would be 15 million. Annual interest on the balance would be say £250,000. Assuming repayment of principal over say 12½ years, the annual outgoings would be perhaps £650,000. The property would however be available for leasing for part of the period. Assuming a net return

of 3-4% on the property an income might be expected to balance the annual outgoings over the same $12\frac{1}{2}$ years period.

13. So far these figures suggest that on face all the properties affected would be acquired. It has already appeared however that the only owners suffering a real loss would be those forced, for one reason or other to sell on the limited market for properties of this kind. These owners retaining possession and occupation would suffer only to the extent that their tenure is uncertain. From this it is thought that some measures should be sought for limiting the number of properties to be acquired, both from the point of view of retaining as much as possible of the available funds for construction as distinct from acquisition. This might be possible if acquisition were undertaken only with vacant possession. It is not possible to estimate how far this would reduce the demand for acquisition but it would clearly reduce it very substantially.

14. With regard to the management of property so acquired, there appear to be four possibilities:-

- i) Housing Commission,
 - ii) Dept. of Main Roads,
 - iii) Cumberland County Council setting up a property management section,
 - iv) Management being carried out by Real Estate Agents on behalf of Council,
- iii) is probably the least desirable. If properties were transferred on acquisition direct to D.M.R. the Dept. might be able to absorb the expanded property management commitment.

Management spread over Real Estate Agents throughout the area, a panel of say 2 or 3 within each municipality, might be satisfactory and result in a net return as suggested in para 12.

14. In consideration of all these factors it appears that if outright acquisition were decided upon these possibilities emerge:-

- i) a capital outlay of say 15 millions would be spread over a fairly long period - possibly 20 years - so that apart from a higher demand to purchase at the outset the average outlay could be well below 1 million annually;
- ii) annual outgoings by way of repayment of principal and interest might be balanced - or nearly so - by income until such time as demolition took place for constructional work.
- iii) apart from those owners forced by the need to move elsewhere to sell

their properties, other owners might be deterred from demanding acquisition if a guarantee could be given that they would be undisturbed for say 10-15 or 20 years. From this aspect it appears desirable to refine the acquisition programme in such terms of years. This would of course not alter the eventual cost of acquisition but it would tend to spread it more evenly over the whole period.

The conclusion in brief is that straightforward acquisition is in many ways the most satisfactory and clear cut solution but it would necessitate a large outlay of money.

15. Another possibility may be examined of acquisition in a different manner. This disadvantages of acquisition in the way indicated above is the heavy capital outlay for properties not required for road works for many years. In respect of the roadworks it may be said broadly that the properties will remain undisturbed for $12\frac{1}{2}$ years if the works are spread over 25 years. If a more specific programme of construction were decided upon then the properties required in those three periods could be clearly defined:-

- i) immediately - for the first 5 year programme - say £4 m.
- ii) by 1965 - for the programme 1960-1970 - " £8 m.
- iii) by 1975 - for the programme 1970-1980 - " £8 m.

The middle of the second and third periods is chosen because in any event some resumption would be called for to enable road works to be carried on in sections.

16. The £4 m. for the first period would be likely to be spread over say $2\frac{1}{2}$ years and would be straightforward acquisition with vacant possession. The cost of acquisition of property for the next period i.w. by 1965 could be met in this way:-

the property could be bought in a way analogous to conversion from freehold for a 10-year lease.

The financial consideration would be a sum which would represent the full value of the property at present valuation, ten years hence when the owner surrendered possession.

Example 1.

- (i) Present valuation £5,000
- Assumed value 10 yrs.
hence with depreciation 4,400
@ $1\frac{1}{4}\%$ (assuming the value
of improvements only would
be appreciated)
- Present value of £4,375 @ $4\frac{1}{4}\%$ £2,900
- (ii) Considering the aggregate of 8 millions
the figures would be
- Present valuation 8 "
- Assumed value 10 yrs. 7 "
hence with depreciation $1\frac{1}{4}\%$
- Present value of 7 m. @ $4\frac{1}{4}\%$ 4.6 "

Example 2.

- (i) Present valuation £5,000
- Assumed value 20 yrs. hence with
depreciation at $1\frac{1}{4}\%$ 3,750
- Present value of £3,750 at 4% in
10 yrs. 2,535
- Present value @ $4\frac{1}{4}\%$ 2,460
- (ii) Present valuation 8 millions
- Assumed value 20 yrs. hence with
depreciation at $1\frac{1}{4}\%$ 6 "
- Present value of £6 m. at 4% in 20 yrs. 2.73 "
- Present value @ $4\frac{1}{4}\%$ 2.6 "

17. As previously suggested there are likely to be outstanding mortgages in many cases and it appears that any payment made to an owner must go firstly to the discharge of the mortgage.

The example (1) might be examined again in that light. Assuming an outstanding mortgage of £2,975 the balance of say £3,000 repaid by 1975, the affect would be that the vendor would find himself in free possession of the house for 10 yrs. but with capital of nil. If he invests £220 per annum at $4\frac{1}{2}\%$, the money he would otherwise be paying in principal and interest instalments, at the end of 10 yrs. it would become £2,700. At the time possession of his home is taken he would thus be homeless but with £2,700 capital. On the other hand, if the repayment of his mortgage followed its original course at the end of 10 yrs. the amount of the original

mortgage would only have been reduced by about £500 (the instalments during the earlier period representing largely interest) so that the value of his interest in the property would be £1,925

18. Where the property will be required in 20 years' time the example above becomes as follows:

(i) Present valuation	£5,000
Assumed value 20 yrs. hence	3,750
Present value of £3,750 at $4\frac{1}{2}\%$	2,460
(ii) Present aggregate valuation	8 millions
Assumed value 20 yrs. hence	6 "
Present value of $\frac{3}{4}$ m. @ $4\frac{1}{2}\%$	2.6 "

In the case of (i) the cash payment would be used towards the discharge of the outstanding mortgage but the owner would be required to continue repayments for a further $2\frac{1}{2}$ years. At the end of the 20 yrs. his £220 per annum would, at $4\frac{1}{2}\%$, become £5,450 in comparison with the situation whereby he would have paid off the mortgage and be the owner of a house worth £3,750.

19. Logically therefore this seems an equitable proposition. The intangible factor is that the house owner would be chancing being able to retrieve himself ten years hence with his £2,700 capital which he would be likely to compare unfavourably with the £2,000 he originally put into the house being acquired. In the case of the 20 year deferment the end result might be more attractive to the owner. Nevertheless, as an ideal solution would be one which property owners acknowledge as an equitable and reasonable alternative to compensation but which at the same time they find has too little attraction for them to accept there may be merit in it.

20. To summarise the foregoing, the possibility outlined is as follows:-

- (1) In the case of property which the owner is prepared to sell with vacant possession straightforward acquisition will be undertaken at current valuation.
- (2) Until the property is required to be demolished for County Road purposes it will be let and managed either by D.M.R. or through local Estate Agents.

- (3) In respect of other properties affected no payment for compensation will be made but the properties will on demand by the owner be purchased wither
- (i) on a deferred possession basis; or
 - (ii) on a vacant possession basis.

REVIEW OF THE SCHEME

A. Planning Problems of the Scheme

1. Over-centralisation and congestion of industry, commerce, shopping, administration and entertainment in an around the City of Sydney.
2. Congested and confused traffic within the inner areas due to over-centralisation, an outmoded road system, inadequate transport terminals and lack of parking space.
3. A band of slum housing in which a quarter of million people live under conditions far below acceptable Australian standards.
4. Conflicting land uses permitting heavy factories and similar developments to bring into living areas the hazards of fire and explosion and the depression of soot, noise and heavy traffic.
5. Residential areas sprawled for miles without any real identity or provision for open space, social or cultural life.
6. Premature subdivision extending over great areas of rural land, forcing the provision of roads and other utilities out of all proportion to housing needs.
7. Destruction of natural beauty on foreshores and other natural features, depriving the County of its most celebrated natural asset.

B. Principal Objectives of the Scheme

1. A large scale of decentralisation of employment, with a view to relieving the present disabilities and inconveniences suffered by the people as well as economic loss sustained by industry and commerce, by reason of the existing over-concentration of activities within the inner core of the County.
2. Improvements in living conditions by arranging the to-day needs of the family in proper relationship with the home.
3. The establishment of employment in more convenient reach of the worker's home, thus reducing the cost and time of the journey to work.
4. A remedy for the present shortage of conveniently located, parks, sports ovals, play-grounds and health facilities.
5. A reduction of traffic congestion and road accidents.
6. Definition of suitable sites for industrial development.
7. The provision of an improved and co-ordinated transport system.
8. A basis for a complete and economical system of utility services.

9. Reduction in cost of production - and also in the cost of living - by eliminating wasteful expenditure on transport, travel and abortive development.
10. The gradual replacement of slums.
11. The fostering of a healthy community spirit by residential development in planned neighbourhoods.
12. The safeguarding of food - producing land by curbing premature subdivision.
13. The protection and enhancement of the beauty of the County.
14. A higher standard of landscape beauty, civic design and architectural order and harmony.

C Review of the Aims and Principles of the Scheme

There is no doubt that the aims and principles of the Scheme were right. To create better living conditions, to ease congestion, provide up to date road system, sports areas, protection natural beauty, etc., are such aims which are in the interest of the present and future population.

If the Scheme needs revision (zoning and Ordinance) it is for the purpose that it should fulfil the aims and principles set out above.

This revision of the Scheme is in two kinds:

- (i) Minor adjustments without altering the Scheme as a whole basically, such as General Exclusion Areas, variations, suspensions, etc.
- (ii) Major alteration of the Scheme, which may be necessary in consequence of careful consideration of the following factors:-
 - (a) Drastic change in the social structure of the community (No evidence of such a sudden change)
 - (b) Population increase in a large scale.
 - (c) Substantial increase or decrease in industries.
 - (d) Time factor, how long does it take, the implementation of the Scheme.
 - (e) Economy especially related to the time factor.

D. Investigations carried out and facts obtained in 4 years.

1. Population increase

Taking into account yearly census figures showing at 1954 in the County a population of 1,928,950, we can safely expect a yearly increase

of 35,000 in the coming 15 years giving 2½ million in 1970.

2. Industry

Survey of non-conforming industries completed. Figures showing decrease of employment in inner areas and increase in outer areas is promising, although decrease of employment in Botany and Marrickville is not specially wanted. It looks like the whole process is going to be slow. On the other hand on statistical figures, economical facts and other factors do not seem to justify any special big scale industrial boom in Australia in the near future.

3. Traffic

Substantial traffic investigations have been carried out. We got estimates about vehicular increase, also complete traffic counts and capacity figures related to the new road system. Classification by means of priority has been made. This is one of the most complex problems which is related to decentralisation, densities and economic basis of the whole Scheme.

4. Living Areas

Local plans have been made or near completion for the City, Ashfield, North Sydney, Lane Cove, Rockdale, Strathfield, Auburn, Hunters Hill, Fairfield, Camden, Campbelltown and Sutherland. Some of the municipalities now have complete land surveys.

5. Open Space

Land survey has been completed and as a result General Exclusion Areas have been fixed in areas where substantial building activity took place in interim period. Classification according to importance of areas also made. Detailed sketches show the use of many important areas.

6. Green Belt and Inner Rural Areas

Land survey has been completed. Special thorough investigation has been carried out concerning land use, subdivision and soil conditions. Variation areas have been fixed in practice during the last 4 years.

E. Achievements as Result of the Scheme

1. Zoning.

Building activities have been curtailed to the proper zoning generally except in cases where substantial interim development necessitated general exclusion and variation areas or suspension.

2. Relief of congestion in central areas.

Population is decreasing in central areas generally. Relocation of markets is an important step.

3. Dispersal of Employment.

Has a promising start, it is desirable to speed up on a much larger scale.

4. Roads.

Approximately $\frac{1}{4}$ million pounds spent on acquiring of land for County Road purposes, some of them constructed and in use. To solve traffic congestion in inner areas surveys have been prepared and interim traffic control schemes have been worked out, some of them in use. ^{Railway Square} (Parking space).

5. Open Space

Half a million pounds spent on acquisition of land for Open Space purposes. The acquisition of some important areas as Lansdowne and Moorefield near completion. Some of the land acquired already handed over to local Councils for development.

6. Green Belt

Sprawl of urban development stopped. Quite a few institutes have been erected in Green Belt areas and more intensive agricultural development is evident in some parts.

F. Conclusions

Time and Economical Factors

We can not design more than 30 years ahead. History shows that from time to time new technical inventions and following economical changes completely revolutionise all the basic principles of town planning. This does not mean that cities are rebuilt in every 30 years, but if a newly introduced planning scheme is not implemented during a certain time it will be out of date. See Canberra Plan. If this delay is a result of lack of the necessary funds either more money should be raised or the scheme to be reduced to suit the financial means.

Population Increase

Expecting a 35,000 population increase in the coming 15 years reaching a population of $2\frac{1}{2}$ million in 1970, we can state that this is the limit of what the Cumberland County Council's Scheme can take at its present form. As soon as it is evident that population is going to increase substantially

over 2½ million, the preparation of a new scheme is necessary probably by means of creating new satellite towns.

Industrial Increase.

It is not very likely that a really substantial increase of industries (mostly secondary) will occur in the County in the coming 15 years. To fill up the areas zoned for industrial uses the shifting of non-conforming industries has been taken into account. Considering economical factors and figures of dispersal we can not expect that this procedure will be finished in 15 years time, so we have to take into account the continuance of congestion of the inner areas and try to ease it as far as possible.

Living Areas

The problem is where to house ½ million people in the coming 15 years. Are the living areas of the Scheme adequate for that or will we have to give up the Green Belt for that purpose or jump over it and house the population in new living areas behind the Green Belt?

Exact calculation should be carried out as to what population the Scheme is able to accommodate taking into account the following factors:

- (1) All areas zoned for living (Restricted Living Areas as well) should be calculated, totally filled up on the same density basis which has been used as the preparation of the Scheme.
- (2) General Exclusion Areas should be calculated totally filled up on the same density basis as neighbouring Living Areas.
- (3) Variation Areas capacity to be calculated.
- (4) Part of Suspension Areas going to be Living Area, their capacity should be calculated also.
- (5) Review of Green Belt allows some places smaller subdivision than 5 acres, creating rise of density to some degree. This also should be calculated.
- (6) Nothing happened so far concerning slum clearances. It is not necessary to argue how ^{quickly} vitally important that this Slum Belt should disappear as ~~gingerly~~ as possible.

We should consider the possibility to replace them by high density multi-storey flats, on a new density basis similar to overseas examples (U.S.A., Denmark etc.) They could house more people than to-day, still up to the highest standards of hygiene and other

requirements of modern living. Being sometimes only walking distance from place of employment, they would help relieve the congestion of inner city area and traffic also. This is a project which is really economical also.

- (7) Similar treatment suggested near the centres of selected suburbs and in the vicinity of some of the big industrial areas.

Probably 1-7 would be sufficient to accommodate $\frac{1}{2}$ million people and if not the balance could be housed outside the Green Belt ^{enlarging} extending as far as St. Marys, Penrith and Campbelltown, without creating new satellite towns.

Roads

The most difficult problem of the Scheme. Time factor and economy even more important than anything else. To implement our new road system the main obstacle is the lack of sufficient funds in time. Introducing stage development, priority for the most urgent helps to a certain extent.

Our recent studies of traffic problems based on surveys, traffic counts, capacity figures etc., which have not been available at the time the Scheme was prepared, relieved some very difficult problems. One of these important problems is the inadequacy of the Harbour Bridge to cope with increased traffic flow. Developing North Sydney to some kind of second city would relieve congestion on the Bridge and in the City generally, should be thoroughly investigated.

1954

SYDNEY - past and future

"IT MAY BE DOUBTED WHETHER, AMONG THE ARTS YET TO BE DISCOVERED, OR AT LEAST PERFECTED, AMONG THE ALMOST UNINVESTIGATED SCIENCES TO BE SHAPED INTO FORM, WORKED OUT IN THEORY, AND HARDER STILL, IN PRACTICE BY THE STRONG MEN OF THE FUTURE, SHOULD NOT BE INCLUDED THE ART AND SCIENCE OF CITY LIFE..... To mould the congeries of life massed around a given centre, say the miles around Charing Cross, into a systematic organism, so as to give the most good possible to every one of the vast human family there contained, is a matter difficult of achievement, and one admitting a vast improvement over all former precedents."

John Storer "Our Cities" 1870

Section 1. - POLITICALS AND THE CITYPart (a) - Social Organisation and Planning

"Going for the Doctor" - This phrase is now a racetrack colloquialism for hard riding; it was derived from the Australian bushman's fearless ride, often through flooded creeks or bushfires, to fetch the nearest doctor to a bad case.

Sydney "went for the doctor" in 1945 when she realised that she was in danger of a breakdown. Sydney took her doctor's advice in 1951 when she adopted the Cumberland County Council's remedial plan of land use. This book is a case-history of the disease -- it describes the patient's early life, symptoms and response to treatment.

This first section is unashamedly technical; it will analyse the life and death cycles of a city, and the failure of "bush medicine" applied before 1945.

The medical analogy is justified in as much as the city is a complex organism of men and material. The study of a city is a study of how people behave. People in cities act in groups, as family cells and as associations or individuals pursuing economic, technical, social and/or political ends; the city itself is a strong cell-group in national life.

Each group is the best guardian of its own interests. In as much as group behavior is consistent and predictable, hypotheses and principles can be drawn; the

study of cities becomes a social science.

The city organism continually acts to ensure its own self-preservation. Interference in the social organism, discipline of its parts, becomes necessary whenever the unchecked play of one social force imperils the safety of the whole city. The social organism acts to protect its lines of supply, its trade; it maintains tariffs and police; it regulates water supply, sanitation and structural standards; it appoints land-use planners.

City planning is a social science: science only deals with what it can measure; social science can only measure probabilities on the basis of statistical trends.

"The social world . . . is not devoid of a measure of rationality if approached with the expectations of Macbethian cynicism. It is this measure of rationality which can justify social planning . . . Since this rationality consists in a limited number of potential trends, one of which is bound to materialise, social planning, correctly understood, is the marshalling of human and material forces in rational anticipation of those potential trends." x

These are the basic tenets of land-use planning as applied to the city of Sydney by the Cumberland County Council; The C.C.C. is the "doctor" appointed in 1945 to save Sydney from a disease that had been mounting to crisis point for half a century.

On Theory and Practice - Men must act. The necessity of action, of doing something in order to stay alive, is forced on most men almost every day of their lives. Although men (and women) often act in quite irrational fashion, in ways that are not at all logical and consistent, for the most part we adopt a series of beliefs --- a "philosophy" of largely unconscious assumptions --- which give security and coherence to thought, meaning to action.

Because of the unrelenting necessity for action of some kind or other, men have not the opportunity to enquire into and decide finally the truth of their

x Morgenthau, Hans J. "Scientific Man versus Power Politics"
University of Chicago Press, 1946. p.151.

theories before they act. Mostly they jib at the mental effort; in any case final decision is not possible. To a certain extent, bearing in mind our own limitations, it is possible for us to learn from experience. Some say it is the best, while others call it the only teacher.

A child learns from its personal experience that to touch a hot stove will bring a burned finger; that child must then change its attitude towards stoves if it is to survive without burns. Similarly, it is possible for the inhabitants of a city to learn from the collective experience of their group; today's theories of city planning are a series of lessons derived from the experience of the Industrial Revolution. In order to survive, a city must adapt its behaviour patterns, it must change its ways, to fit in what it has learnt from analysing its own experience.

We endanger our survival as individuals, as groups, or as nations, in as much as we fail to learn from experience; in as much as we neglect to cultivate the historical sense; in as much as we rely, as a guide for action, on out-moded, impractical, unrealistic or merely inaccurate assumptions.

The Cumberland County Council - Sydney is a city of two million white inhabitants contained within the County of Cumberland in the Australian sovereign State of New South Wales. In this book we are setting out to re-examine the city of Sydney as a city; we will re-assess why and how it was built, and how and why it could develop in the future. We will attempt to trace how, why and to what extent Sydney has grown in automatic response to economic, technological, social and political patterns; in other words we will examine the largely unconscious intellectual assumptions of those who have built our present city. At the date of writing, the Cumberland County Council is of particular interest and importance to Sydney people, who are looking to it for an account of its stewardship of planning responsibilities over the ten years since its inception. In Parts 5 and 6 of this book, we will examine the largely conscious intellectual assumptions on which it has based its actions over the period 1945-1955. To do this we will analyse the events of these last ten years as objectively as is possible at such short range.

Organism or Mechanism? - There already exists a broad theoretical framework around which can be moulded a detailed description of Sydney's life, times, setting and structure. For example, the "organic" analogy has been highly developed in recent years to describe the development of cities in terms of the development of biological organisms. This concept has replaced the old analogy of the city as an economic and social mechanism, which implies that the internal organisation of the city is mechanical: Organisms are living, vital, ever changing; they grow and they can decay; they encompass contradictory tendencies to develop in different directions and they are continually changing in response to the more powerful of these tendencies.

The building of a city entails the making of decisions about the use of land, about the quality of design and workmanship of buildings and their surrounds. Such decisions are made every minute of the day in their thousands by house-builders, industrialists, business men and governments. The statistical sum of all these value judgements (i.e. decisions about what a person wants) is faithfully recorded in the stones, steel, space and land-use pattern of a village, town or city.

"Mind takes form in the city; and in turn, urban forms condition mind". ✕ This means for example, that a power-proud city (see illustration of rebuilt Moscow) will breed monolithic structures on the axes of wide, straight avenues -- thus an authoritarian mind creates an authoritarian form -- and as a consequence monumental structures tend to subjugate further the minds of people moving about them; in this way urban forms condition mind. In contrast to this, a humanist attitude towards community life can result in the creation of lightweight urban forms in proper scale with the size of a man; such forms in turn react to condition the minds of those who live among them.

A city does not, of course, consist merely of buildings, streets, sewers and the like. It is built for people by people, and the term "city" implies large numbers of them.

✕ Mumford, Lewis;

Culture of Cities - 1938. p.5.

A city can best be understood as a living organism, made up of cell-patterns, of family and larger pressure groups, seeking self preservation plus the satisfaction of their desires and aspirations - having a physical structure constantly expanding and developing through growth and decay of its parts - possessing a nervous system of delicately balanced communications in which transport arteries supply economic lifeblood - in which the mysterious life-giving forces of economic, technical, social and political developments are constantly acting, reacting and interacting.

Most cities, Sydney being no exception, are built slowly by generations of people who have been forced by circumstances to live together. Many theories have been held as to how men first came to live in embryo urban settlements. It has long been popular to maintain that "man is a gregarious animal" and that some such instinctive gregariousness first led men to come together in villages. It is sometimes possible to believe that people live in cities because they love one another, but a sounder explanation of the phenomenon is that close mutual dependence can best satisfy the basic human needs of both material and emotional security. T.S. Eliot was too bitter: "You ^{dwell} ~~live~~ together to make money from each other".

Just as evidence supports the theory that the development of a child's mind is a miniature reproduction of the whole history of mental development in the race, so it could easily be that in describing the growth of some single city, one is describing the process of city evolution since primeval times. This hypothesis can be applied fairly convincingly to Sydney, which in the beginning, was a simple consuming centre, and which evolved through the stage of being a regional centre for exchange, transport and culture, to the situation of our time -- we find Sydney today a city of wide and complex productive capacity within and for itself; no longer an institution maintained for the convenience of the primary producers, the great modern city often achieves the description of "a gigantic octopus devouring the countryside".

Understanding the City via Economics - A city is first of all an economic

organism; it exists because individuals and groups of people bargain, trade, make contracts with one another, for the supply of food, diamond rings, houses, motor cars and moving pictures. "The unique features of the great modern city -- its *raison d'être*, its organisation, and its special structure -- can only be understood in terms of the contractualistic value system under which it has emerged". x

Transport and trade are inseparable; the place that is naturally the focal point of transport routes becomes an exchange centre; exchange centres generate more demand for transport, the improvement of which creates more opportunities for exchange . . . in this way an expanding cycle was set in motion in Sydney during the last century. In this way, an economic "urbanizing force" is generated.

The population of the new centre then begins to want a multitude of both essential and luxury goods and services. Concentrations of people create markets for specialists of many kinds .. - specialists by occupations and professions, by businesses, by minor industries - and consequently numbers of new and special kinds of land uses are created. Specialisation creates a further impetus towards concentration plus a further necessity for social cohesion or mutual dependence. The young city acquires a centralising momentum that carries everything before it.

A spirit of competition and mutual exploitation is fostered in big centres where population is concentrated and where sentimental ties or group loyalties are not strong. City folk indulge in great amounts of conspicuous waste in order to gain the recognition and approval of their neighbours. (Thorstein Veblen has analysed this phenomenon in his "Theory of the Leisure Class".) Conspicuous waste can be the expression of an individual, a group, a city or a nation -- the modern American car, the insurance company headquarters, and the Athenian Parthenon are all examples of conspicuous expenditure, made possible by the surplus of wealth that cities can generate.

The Industrial Revolution hit various cities throughout the world that were at all the possible stages of development. Some were already large metro-

x Ratcliff, Richard U. "Urban Land Economics"

McGraw Hill Book Co. Inc. 1st Ed. 1949. p.60

politan centres like London, others were still relatively small trading congeries, while others were mere hamlets destined to boom - perhaps because of their proximity to coal fields. The major impact of industrialisation was not felt in Sydney till after the turn of this century, although railway building had ~~been~~ commenced ~~many~~ 50 years before.

When this changeover from trade to manufacturing occurs, the economic urge toward centralisation becomes even greater. Labour is drawn into the new industries from outside the city; industries in the city seek markets in the country; the mechanisation of agriculture reduces the requirement for rural labour, increases rural productivity and lowers food prices. Disemployed rural workers flock to the city, swelling the labour market, swelling the ranks of consumers, creating more opportunities for manufacture and trade.

The economic structure of a city in the throes of early industrial development is contrived in such a way that concentration and more concentration spells efficiency in immediate economic terms. The generally accepted economists' belief is that concentration at this stage is naturally efficient, because of the great advantages to be gained from the inter-dependence of industry, plus close proximity to the labour pool, the power supplies and the consumers' market. Mumford claims however, that it is a "naive myth" * that "the gigantic metropolis is what it is merely because of its tangible economic benefits or the natural superiority of its geographic situation." * Mumford points out that the railway networks of the world have been "deliberately designed to compel passengers and goods to pass through the metropolis before going elsewhere: each great capital sits like a spider in the midst of its transportation web." He adds that the freight rates of railways systems are contrived to "give a subsidy to the big cities at the expense of the rival towns that are perhaps more conveniently located - - even though the costs of handling freight in a big city, by reason of their very congestion are disproportionately high." *

* Mumford, Lewis:: Culture of Cities, p.233.

Just what happened in New South Wales regarding this will be discussed on later pages. The fact remains that urban industrial centres attract vast amounts of capital which are quickly translated into material congestion.

The city, then is first of all an economic organism. The people of a city must eat; but city people produce no food. So the city extends its financial and cultural dominion over the countryside. It draws in more and more food, water and population from the outside. The city is a consumer of the materials and of the men which it cannot produce in sufficient quantity within its own boundaries. The metropolis holds sway over an area marked out by the extreme limits of its radiating railways and highways, the extent of its money lending market, its zones for the production of vegetables and milk, its water catchment networks, and the limits of circulation of its newspapers.

During this period of a city's economic evolution (later sections of this book will show that Sydney is at this stage) many people feel that there can be no end to the centralising momentum. But nevertheless the cycle will probably close. The momentum will probably exhaust itself. Even if this does not happen, it has been an opinion of great weight in this country that some form of planning and government subsidy should be used to persuade it to stop. There will come a time when concentration will not spell immediate efficiency; some think that this time has already arrived. New trends in power supply, the completion of the Snowy River Scheme the creation of atom power plants which do not depend on proximity to fuel supplies, new developments in faster, more efficient transport and increases in rural fertility, could turn Sydney's tide in favour of a decentralising momentum. Failing such developments, centralism could wither because of the relative fixity and immovable nature of the city structure, because of some reluctance to invest capital in changing the existing inefficient pattern of land use in the central areas.

It is often prophesied that some such failure will result in the abandonment of the worst congested city centres. However, study of the economic base of city development can lead us to an understanding of how to ease the changeover from a centralising to a decentralising momentum. We in Sydney have no exact knowledge of when our urbanising force will be spent, since

it depends so much on outside factors beyond our control, for example, national policy. It is the job of the Cumberland County Council, in so far as Sydney is concerned, to study the possible future trends, and to guide city development in the path that will save it from strangulation or abandonment .. to maintain its security in a changing economic environment.

In order that the economic functions of production, distribution, exchange and consumption can be carried on, a great demand arises for land with special characteristics that is, urban land. Rural land is mainly valued according to its inherent qualities e.g. the nature of its soil: Urban land, on the other hand, is valued according to its relationships - a block of land adjacent to a railway yard would have a special value for use by heavy manufacturing industry, while a vacant block of land in a heavily built up retail street would have a special value to a chain store.

It used to be thought that land had inalienable properties and was fixed in position and magnitude. Ideas such as this have been discredited by the recognition of ~~such circumstances~~ the action of wind and water in causing soil erosion and the spread of desert lands, swamp reclamation and so on. Also the area of land that can be used for some particular purpose becomes greater as transportation improves. A city office worker now finds it possible to live at French's Forest, 10 miles from the central city, because he can drive to work every day; he could not have done so 50 years ago. It was once thought that land and capital were two separate and distinct economic concepts, but ... "What we mean by land in practical life is something which .. consists.. of the accumulated result of human effort, and accordingly it is usually regarded as capital, the term land being reserved for the properties of the soil . . Just where we have .. for instance a bare site in the centre of a great city - - we find that its value depends more than ever on capital, that is to say, accumulated effort. Only it is capital . . that has been expended on the surrounding areas. Therefore the distinction between land and capital, which it seems difficult or impossible to draw, would be theoretically useless if drawn." x

x Wicksteed P.H. "The Common Sense of Political Economy" Vol. 1.

Routledge and Sons, 1933. p.365

Every block of urban land stands in an unique spatial and functional relationship with every other block. The exact nature of this relationship in space and between functions tends to determine the use to which each block is put . . which tends to be that use for which the land has maximum market value.

Because blocks of land with the same character, with much the same spatial and functional relationships, are often found next to one another as part of a larger area, the same land uses tend to group themselves together; because of this the urban pattern tends to follow a process of natural zoning. Heavy industries often group themselves together; but especially do retail shops and wholesale distributors tend to group themselves in different parts of the city; living areas with special characters are generally formed naturally.

Although in a perfect market the perfect relationship of perfect supply and perfect demand would result in natural zoning, the processes of the urban land market only hesitatingly tends to produce the most efficient land-use pattern, even in terms of money; the urban land market is one of the most imperfect there is. It has been claimed that:- "The basic objective of city planning is to attain the same land use pattern that would emerge naturally from condition of perfect competition." x

The main faults in the "free" urban land market are: the constant fluctuations in the quantity and quality of demand, which is never stable; the slow response of the supply side, where the bulky, fixed and time consuming nature of real property is a decisive factor preventing dynamic responses.

Demand fluctuates over booms and slumps; it fluctuates with changes in incomes, with changes in fashions, long term social changes, technological changes, the emergence of new industries and trends in industrial location, the role of the family and the increased mobility of labour.

Perfect market reactions are also hindered by the legal complexities of conveyancing; the freezing of titles under leases and estates; foreclosure laws which favour the owner remaining in possession long after his default; and emotional attachments to property long after its retention becomes economically unreasonable. "The urban land market is unique in the number

and power of the limitations of the free interplay of supply and demand." xx
x Ratcliff, Richard U. "Urban Land Economics" p.378 1949

xx Ibid p.301.

As well as the imperfections of the market already outlined, there are others deliberately imposed to prevent breakdowns in city life; - - fire, health and building regulations; subdivision controls and land-use zoning - - all these are being applied in Sydney at the present time.

The history of fire regulations shows that they have been devised after disastrous fires have destroyed large sections of cities. . Sydney was wise enough to learn from the experience of other cities and their Great Fires; similarly health regulations are the aftermath of plagues; subdivision controls the aftermath of wanton orgies in speculation; land-use zoning is a preventative and cure of further traffic congestion and industrial blight - - both of which have reached sufficient peaks of destructiveness in Sydney. Land-use planning aims to prevent our traffic problems getting as big as those of some American and British cities, and to prevent industrial blight spreading here as it has in the English Midlands.

Rent Control, Land Sales Control, limits on construction, and priorities for building materials, are other forms of market restriction commonly imposed during wars, and often retained during post-war years. Apart from the integrated powers of modern land-use planners, governments have long been vested with power of land resumption for the "public good".

The urban land market deals in property rights not in property itself. An owner's rights are "exclusive but not absolute"; i.e. he may exclude all other citizens from his land, but he has no absolute right to do anything that he likes on it. He is restricted from causing harm to his neighbours and he must share the earnings of his land in the form of rates. He may have to give up his property rights if his land is required for some essential public use, He is then entitled to just compensation for resumption.

This summary of the economic processes of city development is a brief

and general outline of how this branch of the subject is understood at the present time. Sydney, like Manchester, Rio de Janeiro, New York or London, has its own individual factors in the theoretical equation. It is these that concern us above all else, and it is these individual traits that we will examine in detail in the following Sections, after we have considered those other elements of city life which seem to be common to all big centres.

Via Technology - The Industrial Revolution is devouring its children: The industrialised world today faces the possibility of destruction by its own hand. Nuclear fission could do the job in one dramatic exchange; but the continued constriction of life in cities could be no less effective.

It took the 1939-45 War to make most people realise the depths of perversion to which we had sunk in the use of machine technology. Previous to that, various commentators and satirists had rebelled against uncritical acceptance of the mixed blessings of mechanisation; their common thesis was that the machine was becoming an end in itself; human values were being swamped.

The contemporary city-crisis is a significant part of this wider problem. Cities throughout the world are what they are because of contemporary techniques; the danger of technology running away with us is a problem to be faced both at the international and the city level.

Twentieth century cities are shaped directly by their railways and road transport networks; by their supplies of steam, electricity and maybe atom power; by their heavy metals industries; and by their mass production of consumer goods, the material evidence of material wealth.

In our system, money dictates the rate of technical change; economics and technology are interwoven; no machine is brought into use until the money structure of the city demands it. Machinery lying idle represents unproductive capital; money and machinery are indistinguishable, as are money and land.

When people are cramped together in industrial cities technical problems multiply; technicians are continually having to invent new machines to solve problems created by those last installed. For example, early industrial crowding brought crises in sanitation, so the engineers had to find ways to install sewerage and building reservoirs. In answer to a similar crisis, engineers have now shown us how to build new types of roads. It almost seems that, for the technicians, "nothing is impossible".

Although science and technology can tell us how to do practically anything at all, including how to destroy ourselves en masse, our resources of time, labour and materials are still limited. In order to decide exactly what we will do, we must ask "What do we want?"..."What shall we budget for technology?".

We have to separate ends and means. The motor car, the conveyor belt, the journey to work, the clover leaf crossing, the vast expressway, are only means to ends....Supposedly means to "The good life". Since so much of our time is spent with machines, it would surely be wise to make that part of life more pleasing. It would be rational to minimise waste of time, and of energy, to conserve resources, to concentrate on ends. However, waste is an integral factor in the modern economy; also, if we concentrate on immediate ends, we will not be setting aside resources to meet future needs - - we will not be producing the means of production.

All prudent men set aside some part of their existing resources to meet future needs, and when they do so, they are planning for the future. Land-use planning in cities sets aside areas for future essential needs. The planner relates existing and potential demands to existing and potential resources; he tries to judge the relative importance of conflicting demands.

When we plan for cities we are planning in a climate of continuous technical innovation - - something new in technics is always just around the corner. Men of all periods have been inventive, but the speed and complexity of technological change has never been so great as it is in our time. It is impossible to predict with any degree of accuracy what changes in city life will be forced by new techniques in transport, building methods, production and consumption habits and so on. Who could have predicted the full effects of the motor car on the shape of the city?

Via Politics - There will always be conflicts of self-interest in a city;

unity of opinion cannot exist unless artificially enforced. The city is where personalities clash, ideas contrast and policies conflict; it is also where men co-operate and find compromises to their common problems. Village, town and city are three acts in the drama of co-operative action. It is only by studying this drama that we can understand how policies are decided.

Since the technicians can give us whatever we are prepared to pay for, and the economists can show us how to pay for any thing we want the only question remaining is "what do we want?"

A single person in a big city cannot have much personal feeling for mere acquaintances or for strangers he encounters in the street. Reserve and indifference characterise most person to person contacts in cities, except perhaps in times of common stress --- e.g. the Londo blitz, a Sydney tram breakdown. The most characteristic thing about social and political life in cities is that people act less as individuals than they do in groups - - - they create a multitude of associational groups based on common interests; e.g. trade unions, professional institutes, reform groups, lodges, ex-service clubs, political parties, manufacturers' and employers' chambers, together with thousands of others. One man may belong to several; or he may belong to one or none - - - but he nevertheless will either live among, or mix with people of similar cultural background, status, income and/or character. City life allows people to choose more or less freely what groups they will give their loyalties to; it avoids the social pressure to belong, and the restriction of choice exerted in small towns and villages.

Thus it appears that political life is no longer thought of as a matter of several million individuals each separately tied to a central government. The interaction of groups is now thought to be the central fact of politics. Although a cricket club may be primarily a social group, it may campaign for more cricket pitches, less tax on sporting goods, or for a liquor license; similarly although a political party is primarily a political group, it may hold dances and picnics. The groups all exist for individuals, and the State may be said to exist for the groups... These modern theories have been summarised by Latham "the legislature referees the group struggle, ratifies the victories of the successful coalitions and records the terms of the surrenders, compromises and conquests in the form of statutes."* Allowance must be made here for the fact that government agencies are themselves groups, with their own interests, and not mere registers. The State may be thought of as of merely another group of people, that is, the expressors and administrators of policy. The State does not absorb all the loyalties of individuals: churches, parties, unions, clubs etc., also hold the loyalty and obedience of their members.

Each Trade-Union, each Chamber of Commerce, each professional institute, each cricket club has its own rules, regulations and codes of behaviour. Similarly, government lays down rules, regulations and codes of behaviour for the groups and their members. These are embodied in laws made by Parliaments; in democratic countries, these laws are mostly decided by compromises between conflicting demands.

"Every statute tends to represent compromise because the very process of accommodating conflicts of group interest is one of deliberation and consent... A vote represents the balance of strength. What may be called public policy is actually the equilibrium reached in the group struggle at any given moment, and it represents a balance which the contending factions of groups constantly strive to weigh in their favour". **

* Latham, Earl; "The Group Basis of Politics - Notes for a Theory in the American Political Science Review Vol. 46, No. 2 p.376 (June 1952)

** Ibid, p. 380.

Land-use planning is part of the governmental process; it brings together all the individuals, organised groups, and authorities concerned with particular problems, and tries to resolve unnecessary conflicts ... planning attempts to ensure that the satisfaction of some demands now, does not destroy all hope of satisfying others in the future. The central technique of all democratic government, including land-use planning, is compromise. "The fundamental conception is that if you can only bring disputants into a room and persuade them to talk over their quarrel in a neutral atmosphere the great probability is that they will not fight. Each side will feel so anxious to preserve the sympathy of the on-looking world that they will put their case as reasonably as possible, and then it will be found either that between the contentions so reasonably stated there is really very little difference, or one of them will be found to be putting forward what really is an altogether untenable proposition and will have to give way" x This was said by Viscount Cecil about international compromises, but it applies almost as well to the way in which city conflicts are resolved; the vital difference being that city government possesses power to enforce decisions should individual self-interest make compromise impossible. Government establishes the "norms of permissible behaviour" in group relations and enforces these. Law enforcement by government, the use of power by the State, is no less ethically justified than the use of power by a group over its members; e.g., the internal discipline of a trade union, a business firm, a Church.

This essay cannot hope to do more than sketch the main outlines of political functioning in cities. Some such sketch of the broad framework of political theory is necessary if we are to try to understand the history of conflicts in the city of Sydney, and if we are to estimate the success

x Viscount Cecil quoted in Morgenthau, Hans J. "SM & P.P."

and failure of attempts to resolve them. "Politics is an art not a science, and what is required for its mastery is not the rationality of the engineer but the wisdom and the moral strength of the statesman. The social world, deaf to the appeal of reason pure and simple, yields only to that intricate combination of moral and material pressures which the art of the statesman creates and maintains." x x ~~Vicount Cecil~~.

On Various Myths - Men have always sought to escape the terrors of reality; in poetry, painting and in literature we find innumerable images of perfection, both of human and of material beauty. Similarly, when sensitive men have turned their eyes to the disorganised, ugly and seemingly formless physical world they have sought to "cut it down to size", to reduce it to comprehensible patterns of beauty and logic. The Renaissance garden planners sought to reshape uncouth nature into a humanised landscape of designed formality or of designed informality (according to whether they were Italians or Englishmen). The achievements of the ancient Athenians and the Florentines as city builders are sufficient examples of what is possible when enthusiastic and gifted men apply themselves to the task of changing untidy reality.

Grand city architecture has always sprung from city urges to spend wealth conspicuously. Contemporary city planning theories have their ancient roots in conspicuous expenditure, but also spring from another source - - the 19th century creeds of the utilitarians, who sought "the greatest happiness for the greatest number": Of the rationalists, who believed that reason could solve all human problems; and of the utopians, who desired the abolition of all social conflict.

Although the march of events has proved the inadequacy of these doctrines, their influence has been great, and it would be wise to outline their central features so that we may avoid them in the future.

Utilitarian doctrine works very well indeed in such matters as the supply of water, sewerage and rainage to a large metropolitan area, where the funds available, the costs of services and the number of people that can be served are all matters of exact mathematical calculation. It could well be claimed that the "public utilities" do really achieve "the greatest happiness for the greatest number".

However, the utilitarians did not recognise that it is impossible, when it comes to social life, to decide exactly what the "greatest happiness" is; they did not recognise that every fit man is the best guardian of his own interests, so that it is impossible for any benevolent authority to decide what is best for him.

The utilitarians did not recognise that politics is the art of using power, and that it is the equal distribution of bargaining power among participants that brings about any existing equilibrium in social conflicts.

It is also important to note that the concept of the greatest happiness for the greatest number could contradict the democratic concept of protection for minority groups.

The beliefs of the rationalists have been that "if all men followed reason, the conflicts which separate them would disappear, or at worst be resolved into compromise; the wants from which they suffer would be satisfied; the fears which destroy their lives would be dispelled; and harmony, welfare and happiness would reign" * The key word here is that first "if". Unfortunately for this belief, men will not constantly follow reason. The make-up of a human being is spiritual and irrationally emotional as well. Man will not always follow reasonable advice, and no amount of enlightening education, no amount of reasonable explanation will make them constantly willing to do so. Policies are not always decided by reasoned debate and unanimous vote. Policy making is a matter of groups, of political parties, of power.

* Morgenthau, Hans. "S.M. & P.R."

Town planners in the past have been surprised, time and time again, to discover that their appeals to reason and logic have gone unheeded. They have then realised that reason and logic is not sufficient equipment with which to handle real conflicts of interest. Social problems are not like mathematical problems.

Ebenezer Howard (18 -19) is universally acknowledge as the father of modern British city planning theory. Although a utopian, Howard was not a rationalist. His famous book "Garden Cities of Tomorrow" (A Peaceful Path to Real Reform) shows that he understood the subtleties of social problems. Positive proof of his realism arose in his new cities - - Welwyn and Letchworth - - which were planned and built under his direction, and which are now run along the lines he laid down.

Although most of our now most valued institutions were first the subject of utopian dreams, it has perhaps been unfortunate that the general spirit of utopianism permeated so much of town planning theory in the first half of the century. The general reaction to the excesses of the Industrial Revolution and to the rotten standards of city building accepted in the 19th century, was an eagerness to advocate a policy of perfecting the physical environment by detailed planning, at the same time doing away with all social conflict. The world was hunting for the certain and universal panacea for all social ills - - and the field of town planning was well searched for remedies in the process.

A contemporary American planner, Carol Aronovici, has written concerning the Utopians: - - "The galaxy of utopians from Plat to Campanella and from Saint Augustine and Thomas Moore to H.G. Wells who have dreamt of the "City of God", were not concerned with the physical community. The physical structure of the utopian city was never defined, but the spiritual purpose was forged out of rebellion against existing misery and injustice. Many of the proposals contained in these utopias are now realities and are contributing towards human well-being."*

Lewis Mumford, another American, sees the matter in a different light: --

* Aronovici, Carol; "Towards humanism in community planning". Article Journal of the American Institute of Planners, Winter, 1951.

"The student of utopias knows the weakness that lies in perfectionism; for that weakness has now been made manifest in the new totalitarian states, where the dreams of a Plato, a Cabet, a Bellamy have at many removes taken shape. What is lacking in such dreams is not a sense of the practical; what is lacking is a realisation of the essential human need for disharmony and conflict" ...x x

The rapid industrialisation of the western world in the last century and a half has brought many crises to city life. In order to overcome them we must be continually alert to changing conditions which demand new techniques.

Over this period men of many countries have turned to the study of the city; much work has been done, and a considerable body of data, of analysis, of experiment, now exists. It is on this material that the Cumberland County Council has built. We are fortunate in as much as we can observe and learn from the English and the Americans, who are facing the big-city crisis (in London and New York) in a much more acute form than we yet have faced in Sydney.

The Planner as referee. We have already said that city planning is a social science and that it involves the "marshalling of human and material forces in rational anticipation of potential trends"; we have seen that planning becomes unavoidable when the city organism shows the symptoms of serious disease. We have pointed out that before you plan, you must know what you want to achieve, and so planning involves value judgements - choices between different things; we have tried to show that its practical application must be based on "moral" as well as on material pressures. We have finally seen that its enforcement must depend on the realities of any given political situation.

Edward Bellamy's "Looking Backward" (from the year 2,000 A.D.) described in part the utopian replanning of Boston, U.S.A., this book first published in 1884, is of interest to us because of its influence on Australians during the last two decades of the 19th century, a period that was of tremendous significance to the development of Sydney. We shall discuss it again in Section 2.

x x Mumford, Lewis, "Culture of Cities", p.485; Secker & Warburg, 1938.

Because city planning is a social science, it is inexact --- like all the other social sciences. City growth is a sociological, economic, technological, and political study. A city planning authority must employ specialists to make itself a "specialised generalist and a generalised specialist". It is the job of the planner to study potential trends in such things as population distribution demands for transport of people and goods, the location of industry and land values and so on; it is the planner's job to relate each trend to the others, to study the ramifications of each suggested policy. "One of the most difficult things to learn in the social sciences is that every action inside of the social organism is attended by a reaction, and this reaction may be spread far through the organism, affecting organs and modifying functions which are, at the first view of the matter, apparently so remote that they could not be affected at all."x

The basic technique of the city planner is land-use zoning. Zoning means that certain areas are set aside for particular purposes... industry, commerce, houses, and highways. Land-use planners have authority to veto development of land for a use contrary to a prepared plan. It is part of the understood and agreed conditions of life in cities that certain groups will be permitted to act as "badge wearers"; such groups are the police and the planners. These groups and many others like them, are authorised by some social understanding formulated into laws, to exercise certain strictly limited powers against all other groups and individuals. Democracy protects itself when it appoints many of these groups to exercise power at different levels and to restrict each other.

The planner is a referee of the often strenuous competition among conflicting land-users; he referees the group struggle for land. Referees and umpires the world over are subjected to much abuse and the land-use referees come in for their share in the same way as the football, cricket, boxing and tennis umpires do.

x William Graham Sumner quoted by Morganthau.

The status of umpires and referees depends on the power that is delegated to them by some higher and more powerful authority; tennis umpires have the Lawn Tennis Association behind them, while planners are backed by government. The position of the umpire or planner remains stable for as long as his association or government has confidence in him. A Government remains stable for as long as its electors have confidence in it.

The Players of tennis, cricket, football and of the game of living in cities more or less agree to abide by the rules. This happens when the players realise that unless they do so the game itself would cease to exist. However, somebody has to actually write down the rules, and some authority has to sponsor them. A planning authority writes down rules about which most people will be able to more or less agree; in order to deal with any individual who may absolutely refuse to compromise on the referee's administration of the rules, the planning authority is vested with certain powers; exactly what these powers are here in Sydney will be fully examined in Part 6 of this book.

Planners have to try and discover what most people want in their cities; they have to weigh the advantages and disadvantages operating on the city organism in some particular way, in the same way as doctors estimate the wisdom or otherwise of performing an operation for cancer. Planners, also like doctors, can sometimes disagree. The doctor's patient retains the right to refuse advice. The people of a city retain a similar right to refuse their planner's advice.